

## Message Text

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 01 PEKING 01782 190226Z

64

ACTION EA-09

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-02

INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15

USIA-06 SAJ-01 SAM-01 /070 W  
----- 030981

P 180213Z SEP 75

FM USLO PEKING

TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 4435

INFO AMCONSUL HONG KONG PRIORITY

AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

AMEMBASSY TAIPEI

AMEMBASSY TOKYO

AMEMBASSY SINGAPORE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE PEKING 1782

E.O. 11652: N/A

TAGS: PINT CH

SUBJECT: SHANGHAI'S "STUDY AND CRITICISMS" ON "SHUI HU"

1. 1975 ISSUE NO 9 OF THE SHANGHAI INTELLECTUAL JURNAL "XUEXI YU PIPAN (STUDY AND CRITICISM)", RECEIVED HERE ON AUG 15, CARRIES 9 ARTICLES ON "SHUI HU" TAKING UP 32 OF THE JOURNAL'S 80 PAGES.

2. PERHAPS MOST INTERESTING, IN VIEW OF THE JOURNAL'S STANDING AS AN OUTLET FOR "LEFTIST" VIEWS, IS A MEA CULPA BY THE EDITORS TUCKED AWAY ON PAGE 28. THIS NOTES THAT AN ARTICLE ON LITERARY HISTORY IN THE PREVIOUS ISSUE (ON PAGE 58) HAD SEEN "SHUI HU", DESPITE ITS CAPITULATIONIST TENDENCIES, AS STILL REFLECTING A PEASANT UPRISING AND PROVIDING A USEFUL HISTORICAL LESSON FOR KNOWING "THE STRENGTHS, WEAKNESSES AND DEFEAT OF PEASANT UPRISINGS IN FEUDAL TIMES". THE EDITORS CONTINUE, "RECENTLY, AFTER STUDYING CHAIRMAN MAO'S INSTRUCTIONS AND LU HSUN'S DISCUSSION OF 'SHUI HU' WE REALIZED THIS APPROACH WAS LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 02 PEKING 01782 190226Z

MISTAKEN." (THE AUTHOR IS SAID TO HAVE PERFORMED SELF-

CRITICISM AND ENTHUSIASTICALLY PLUNGED INTO THE BATTLE, AND THE JOURNAL HOPES ITS READERSHIP WILL SEND IN LARGE NUMBERS OF ANTI-"SHUI HU" MANUSCRIPTS).

3. BESIDES ADDING CONSIDERABLY TO THE SUPPLY OF INTRIGUING ALLUSIONS, SEVERAL OF THE ARTICLES APPEAR TO STRIVE FOR A GENERALLY SHARPER FOCUS THAN WE HAVE NOTED EARLIER IN THE CENTRAL MEDIA ON THE DIFFERENCES AND STRUGGLE BETWEEN CH'OA KAI AND SUNG CHIANG AS REPRESENTATIVES OF DIAMETRICALLY OPPOSED POLITICAL LINES. NOT NEW, BUT STRONGLY POINTED UP, IS THE IDEA THAT CH'AO KAI LOST OUT BECUASE, IN PART, HE HAVE TOO MUCH EMPHASIS TO "YI CH'I" (SPIRIT OF SOLIDARITY, BROTHERHOOD, LOYALTY TO FRIENDS) IN HIS DEALINGS WITH SUNG CHIANG, WHO FOR HIS PART USED "YI CH'I" WITH A DIFFERENT CLASS CONTENT TO VITIATE CLASS STRUBBLE. TO THE DEGREE THAT CH'AO KAI CAN BE VIEWED AS ALLEGORICALLY STANDING FOR MAO, AND SUNG CHIANG FOR LIU SHAO-CH'I, LIN PIAO AND THEIR ILK, THIS KIND OF COMMENT ON CH'AO IS STRIKING: "CH'AO KAI WAS LIMITED BY (OR CAGED WITHIN) THE SPIRIT OF THE BROTHERHOOD OF THE RIVERS AND LAKES (ROUGH WESTERN EQUIVALENT: THE SPIRIT OF ROBIN HOOD'S BAND IN SHERWOOD FOREST) AND SO DID NOT SHOW ENOUGH DETERMINATION WHEN HE WAS CARRYING OUT STRUGGLE BETWEEN THE TWO LINES WITH SUNG CHIANG." SIMILARLY, THERE IS A REFERENCE TO CH'SO'S "CONTRADICTIONARY PSYCHOLOGY OF WANTING TO ADHERE TO PRINCIPLE AND YET BEING AFRAID TO DO HARM TO THE SPIRIT OF SOLIDARITY."

4. ALTHOUGH CLASS CONCILIATION IS ONE OF THE MAIN TARGETS OF ATTACK IN THE "SHUI HU" CRITICISM, THE JOURNAL TAKES SOME PAINS TO MAKE THE POINT THAT CLASS ORIGIN IS NOT OF ITSELF DECISIVE IN DETERMINING A PERSON'S STAND TOWARD REVOLUTION. THUS THE LEAD ARTICLE ASSERTS THAT CH'AO KAI "BY HIS ACTUAL REVOLUTIONARY DEEDS FORSOOK THE LANDLORD CLASS TO WHICH HE ORIGINALLY BELONGED AND THREW HIMSELF INTO THE RANKS OF THE PEASANT UPRISING." SUNG CHIANG, ON THE OTHER HAND, HIS BRAIN STUFFED WITH CONFUCIAN IDEOLOGY, "WAS A LANDLORD CLASS CAREERIST AND CONSPIRATOR". WU YUNG, ANOTHER OF THE POSITIVE CHARACTERS IN THE NOVEL, CAME FROM AN INTELLECTUAL BACKGROUND, BUT LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 03 PEKING 01782 190226Z

MANY YEARS OF FOLLOWING CH'AO IN REBELLION AND OF GAINING PRACTICE IN STRUGGLE MADE HIM DEEPLY ATTACHED TO CH'AO'S LINE. HE WAS RELATIVELY ALERT TO SUNG CHIANG'S REVISIONIST SCHEMES AND SEVERAL TIMES CLEVERLY FOILED THEM. (WE IMAGINE THAT A FAIR NUMBER OF THE "STUDY AND CRITICISM" CROWD HAVE A BOURGEOIS BACKGROUND.)

5. BUT ALL THOSE WHO STRUGGLED LONG IN THE REVOLUTIONARY

CAUSE EVENTUALLY BECAME VICTIMS OF THEIR FAILURE TO UNDERSTAND THAT REVOLUTIONS ARE LED TO DEFEAT BY "TALKING 'LOYALTY' WITH REACTIONARY RULERS AND PRACTICING WITH CAPITULATIONISTS A 'SOLIDARITY' THAT EMPHASIZES FRIENDLY FEELINGS, THAT LOOKS AT THE INDIVIDUAL PERSON WITHOUT MAKING CLASS DISTINCTIONS AND THAT DOES NOT PAY HEED TO (QUESTIONS OF POLITICAL) LINE."

6. THAT THIS JOURNAL DOES NOT EXCLUDE THE US FROM THE FOREIGN IMPLICATIONS OF THE "SHUI HU" CRITICISM IS QUITE CLEARLY INDICATED BY AN ARTICLE WHICH USES AS ITS TAKE-OFF POINT THAT FACT THAT PEARL BUCK USED THE TITLE "ALL MEN ARE BROTHERS" FOR HER TRANSLATION OF "SHUI HU." ADGER DRAWING FROM THE NOVEL THE LESSON THAT "IF THE EAST WIND DOESN'T PREVAIL OVER THE WEST WIND, THE WEST WIND WILL PREVAIL OVER THE EAST WIND", THE ARTICLE OBSERVES THAT THE LIKES OF BREZHNEV, WHILE PROCLAIMING THE 'FRATERNAL RELATIONS' OF THE GREAT SOCIALIST FAMILY, ALSO IMPOSE WITH THEIR CANNONS 'THE DOCTRINE OF LIMITED SOVEREIGNTY' AND WITH THEIR TANKS INVADE AND CARRY OUT THE OCCUPATION OF 'FRATERNAL COUNTRIES'." THE ARTICLE THEN GOES ON TO SAY THAT REGARDLESS OF BUCK'S PARTICULAR PURPOSE IN CHANGING THE TITLE, THE ACTION MANIFESTED A SCHEME TO DRAW CHINA'S MYRIAD REVOLUTIONARIES OF THE LI K'UEI TYPE INTO THE PSYCHOLOGICAL STATE OF SEEING ALL MEN EVERYWHERE AS BROTHERS, AND HENCE OF NOT SEEING THE MURDERING KNIVES AT WORK WITHIN AND WITHOUT THEIR CAMP. IT CITES A LETTER WRITTEN BY LU HSUN NOT LONG AFTER THE TRANSLATION WAS PUBLISHED TO MAKE THE POINT (THE ARTICLE'S, NOT NECESSARILY LU HSUN'S) THAT THE ENLIGHTENMENT TO BE GAINED FROM THE TITLE CHANGE IS THAT "ALL AFFAIRS SHOULD BE ANALYZED FROM THE ANGLE OF CLASS AND CLASS STRUGGLE." THE ARTICLE THEN CONCLUDES: "TODAY, THE TIMES OF 'SHUI HU' ARE LONG PAST, BUT UP TO THIS DAY THE SOLIDARITY LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 04 PEKING 01782 190226Z

YI CH'I) OF 'SHUI HU' STILL ENCIRCLES SOME PEOPLE'S HEADS. HOWEVER, THE 'SHUI HU' TYPE OF SOLIDARITY SERVES THE NOVEL'S CAPITULATIONIST LINE. THIS IS A POINT THAT VERY MUCH WARRENTS BEING DEEPLY PONDERED BY ALL OF US TODAY." THAYER

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** PUBLICATIONS, HISTORY, PUBLIC ATTITUDES, CIVIL DISORDERS  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 18 SEP 1975  
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** RELEASED  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Authority:** ElyME  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:** 25 YEAR REVIEW  
**Disposition Date:** 28 MAY 2004  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1975PEKING01782  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** n/a  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** N/A  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Film Number:** D750324-0904  
**From:** PEKING  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1975/newtext/t19750939/aaaabirb.tel  
**Line Count:** 159  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Office:** ACTION EA  
**Original Classification:** LIMITED OFFICIAL USE  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 3  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** LIMITED OFFICIAL USE  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** n/a  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Authority:** ElyME  
**Review Comment:** n/a  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 17 JUN 2003  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review History:** RELEASED <17 JUN 2003 by BoyleJA>; APPROVED <24 OCT 2003 by ElyME>  
**Review Markings:**

Margaret P. Grafeld  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
06 JUL 2006

**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Referrals:** n/a  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** SHANGHAI'S "STUDY AND CRITICISMS" ON "SHUI HU"  
**TAGS:** PINT, CH  
**To:** STATE  
**Type:** TE  
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 06 JUL 2006